

Afr. J. Food Agric. Nutr. Dev. 2020; 20(6): 16669-16688

https://doi.org/10.18697/ajfand.94.18805

MICROBIOLOGICAL QUALITY EVALUATION OF READY-TO-EAT MIXED VEGETABLE SALAD, FOOD INGREDIENTS AND SOME WATER SAMPLES FROM A RESTAURANT IN ACCRA: A CASE STUDY

Kortei NK1*, Annan T², Quansah L³, Aboagye G¹, Akonor PT² and C Tettey⁴



Dr. Nii Korley Kortei

*Corresponding author email: <u>nkkortei@uhas.edu.gh</u>

¹Department of Nutrition and Dietetics, School of Allied Health Sciences, University of Health and Allied Sciences, PMB 31, Ho, Ghana

²Council for Scientific and Industrial Research-Food Research Institute, P. O. Box M20, Accra, Ghana

³Department of Biotechnology, Faculty of Agriculture, University for Development Studies, Nyankpala Campus, P.O. Box 1882, Tamale, Ghana

⁴Department of Biomedical Sciences, School of Basic and Biomedical Sciences, University of Health and Allied Sciences, School of Allied Health Sciences, PMB 31, Ho, Ghana



16669



One serious threat to public health in both developed and developing countries is the microbial contamination of food. This problem poses a great challenge and consequently has economic implications. Causes of microbial contamination are diverse and these may be natural, environmental, or technological. The microbiological quality of most readyto- eat foods is of great significance to human health because they require minimal or no processing when consumed. The aim of this research was to investigate the microbiological quality of some ready-to-eat mixed vegetable salad foods, ingredients as well as the wash water samples of an urban restaurant located in Accra, Ghana. A total of thirty (30) samples categorized into mixed vegetable salads, foods and water obtained from an urban restaurant in the national capital of Ghana, Accra. They were analyzed at the microbiology laboratory and food microbiology laboratories of School of Allied Health Sciences (UHAS) and Council for Scientific and Industrial Research-Food Research Institute (CSIR-FRI), Ghana, respectively. Standard microbiological methods that are per International Organization for Standardization (ISO) Methods and Nordic Committee on Food Analysis Methods (NMKL) were used in determining the presence and levels of bacteria and fungi. Data obtained were transformed from standard to logarithmic forms and reported as mean+standard deviations. The aerobic plate count samples ranged from 0- 4.73 log 10 CFU/g. E-coli counts also ranged between 0- 2.53 log 10 CFU, while Bacillus cereus counts were very low at 0-<10 log 10 CFU/g. Clostridium perfringens and Staphylococcus aureus counts were also very low ranging from 0- 1.0 log₁₀ CFU/g. Enterobacteriaceae counts also ranged from 0- 1.90 log₁₀ CFU/g. Molds and yeasts counts were generally low and ranged from 0- 2.48 log 10 CFU/g and 0- 1.0 log₁₀ CFU/g, respectively. None of the samples tested contained Listeria monocytogenes and Salmonella spp. Fungal microbial loads were minimal given the quantities, and were deleterious to the health of consumers. The study revealed that the bacterial loads on mixed vegetable salads, ingredients and water samples used and served by an urban restaurant in Accra were within safe limits according to American Public Health Association (APHA) and International Commission for Microbiological Specifications for Foods (ICMSF) guidelines and, therefore, good for human consumption.

AGRICULTURE.

Volume 20 No. 6

October 2020

ISSN 1684 5374

SCIENCE

TRUST

Key words: Ready-to-eat, Salads, water, Vegetables, Restaurant, Ghana, Microbial contamination, Consumer safety





INTRODUCTION

Food is consumed by humans to provide the body with nutritional and energy needs. Salad, as defined by Ankita [1], is a food primarily composed of a mixture of raw vegetables and/or fruits. Salad vegetables are globally considered a major source of nutrients namely: vitamins, minerals, proteins and other relevant nutritional components for the proper functioning of the human body [2]. They are particularly a good source of bioactive phytochemicals with varied potentials such as supplying cancer-fighting agents [3], providing nourishment for the skin, fiber which aids in digestion and also prevents colon cancer. Recent studies by Coulibaly-Kalpy *et al.* [4] have established that consumption of salad vegetables contributes to a reduction in the incidence of certain diseases like diabetes, coronary heart disease, colon cancer, high blood pressure, obesity, and various digestive disorders in addition to preventing heart disease and skin cancers [5].

The likelihood of the occurrence of foodborne diseases is increased when salad vegetables are consumed without any thermal or chemical treatment, sometimes without washing and peeling [6]. Mensah *et al.* [7] implicated wash water used for rinsing the vegetables and sprinkling to keep them fresh as a source of contamination. Contamination with microorganisms according to Udo *et al.* [8] arises on fresh vegetables and fruits during cultivation, harvesting, sorting and packing as well as distribution. Furthermore, processing which includes cutting into desired shapes and sizes with knives or other shredding utensils can be a source of contamination [9].

According to WHO [10], although these pathogens cannot be unfortunately detected with the naked eye, felt, tasted or smelled, they have the potential to cause a myriad of diseases of varying severity and ultimately death. The propensity of their encounter is increased especially during processing, handling and storage of these foods which induce the growth conditions of these microorganisms, for example *Staphylococcus aureus, Escherichia coli* and some others. Their effects on the human body are directly proportional to the degree of infection or levels of contamination.

The chances of food contamination increase when food is prepared in bulk (commercial) and is handled by many individuals along the different food processing chains. The occurrence of unexpected contamination of food during bulk cooking usually leads to foodborne disease outbreaks, which can pose danger to the health of consumers and the national economy [11]. Again, regardless of their quantity, if not properly handled, ready-to-eat foods may become a channel of transmission of microbes into human bodies as they are not at all processed before consumption. In connection with the consumption of contaminated foods and drinks (including water), the World Health Organization [12] reported that diarrheal diseases are responsible for more than half of the global burden of foodborne diseases, causing 550 million people to fall ill and 230, 000 deaths every year. Children are at particular risk of foodborne diarrheal diseases, with 220 million falling ill and 96 000 dying every year.

An estimated 1.8 million people suffered and died from diarrheal diseases globally in 2005. There has been a general upsurge of foodborne related illnesses over the years and



this has adversely influenced the health and economic well-being of several developing countries [12].

Sabithi *et al.* [13] emphasized that poor personal hygiene often expedites the transmission of about 60 known pathogens into humans through ingested food. Bacteria such as *Salmonella species*, *Staphylococcus aureus*, *Clostridium perfringens*, *Campylobacter spp.*, *Listeria monocytogenes*, *Vibrio parahaemolyticus*, *Proteus spp.* and *Escherichia coli* can be conveyed by food to cause food poisoning and other foodborne diseases such as tuberculosis, typhoid fever and cholera, dysentery, pneumonia, meningitis, whooping cough, hepatitis and sore throat [14]. Similarly, fungal species such as *Aspergillus spp.*, *Fusarium spp.*, *Penicillium spp.*, *Claviceps spp.*, *Cephalosporium spp. Trichothecium spp.* and others have also been implicated in some foodborne diseases with akin symptoms such as diarrhea, headaches, vomiting, chills, dizziness, and blurred vision [15], although rarely recognized. Fungal toxins produced are pliable and more intoxicating in causing some severe diseases such as cancer in addition to damaging vital organs such as the brain and nervous system, liver and kidney [16].

The aim of this research was to investigate the microbiological quality of some ready-toeat mixed vegetable salad foods, ingredients as well as the wash water samples of an urban restaurant located in Accra, Ghana.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Sample collection

A total of thirty samples (n=30) were obtained from a restaurant in Greater Accra region, Ghana. The samples were randomly sampled over a two-week period in July and August, 2018. Approximately 200g of each sample were collected and stored in sterile specimen containers (Nasco, USA) and transported in an ice chest freezer (Thermos 7750, China) with cold packs at a temperature of 10 °C under aseptic conditions to the UHAS laboratory for microbiological analysis within 2 hours of collection.

Quantitative estimation of total aerobic bacteria

For all samples, 10g were homogenized in 90 ml sterile diluent (0.1% peptone, 0.8% NaCl, pH 7.2) in a stomacher (Lab Blender, Model 4001, Seward Medical, London, England) for 30s at normal speed. From appropriate ten-fold dilutions, aerobic mesophiles were enumerated by pour plate method on Plate Count Agar (Oxoid CM325; Oxoid Ltd., Basingstoke, Hampshire, UK), and incubated at 30°C for 72 h according to Nordic Committee on Food Analysis Methods (NMKL) No. 86 (2006).

Detection of *E-coli*

E. coli were enumerated by pour plate on Trypton Soy Agar (Oxoid CM131), pH 7.3 overlaid with Violet Red Bile Agar (Oxoid CM107), pH 7.4 and incubated at 37 °C for 24 h for total coliforms and 44 °C for 24 h for *E. coli*. Colonies suspected to be coliforms were confirmed on Brilliant Green Bile Broth (Oxoid CM31), pH 7.4, incubated at 37°C for 24 h according to NMKL No. 44 (2004) and suspected colonies of *E. coli* were subcultured into EC Broth (Oxoid CM853), pH 6.9, followed by Tryptone Water (Oxoid





CM87), pH 7.5, for indole test, all incubated at 44°C for 24 h according to NMKL. No.125 (2005).

Determination of Staphylococcus spp.

Staphylococcus aureus was determined using the spread plate method on Baird Parker Agar (BP, CM 275 Oxoid Ltd, Hampshire, England) containing Egg Yolk Tellurite Emulsion (SR54). Suspected colonies were confirmed for coagulase-positive on rabbit coagulase plasma (C14389) according to NMKL Method No. 66 (2009).

Determination of Bacillus cereus

Bacillus cereus was enumerated by the spread plate technique on Bacillus Cereus Agar Base (CM0617) to which Polymyxin B supplement (SR0099E) has been added and confirmed on Blood Agar Base (Oxoid CM0055), for the presence of hemolysis as described in NMKL No. 67, 2010.

Determination of *Enterobacteriaceae*

Enterobacteriaceae was enumerated according to NMKL No. 144, (2005), on Violet Red Bile Glucose Agar (Oxoid CM0485), pH 7.4 and overlaid with another VRBGA. The plates were incubated at 37 °C for 24 h. Suspected colonies were confirmed by the oxidase test. Detection of *Salmonella* was according to NMKL No. 71, (1999). This was carried out by taken 25 g of the sample and 225 ml of Buffered Peptone Water (CM0509) was used as pre-enrichment broth and incubated at 37 °C for 21 h. One (1) ml was subcultured into Rapapport Valisialdis Soya Peptone Broth (CM0866) and subsequently plated on XLD Agar (CM0469 Oxoid Ltd, Hampshire, England). Suspected *Salmonella species* was confirmed by biochemical test on Triple Sugar Iron Agar (Vm381715 214, Merck KGaA Darmstadt, Germany) and serological test using Salmonella Polyvalent Agglutinating Sera (30858501ZD01, UK).

Determination of Listeria monocytogenes

Listeria monocytogenes were determined by International Organization for Standardization Method (ISO) 11290 1 (2004). Here, 25 g of the test sample was weighed into 225 ml of half Frazer (CM 0895) as a pre-enrichment broth and incubated at 30 $^{\circ}$ C for 24 h. Afterward, 0.1 ml of the culture was sub-cultured into Frazer broth and incubated at 37 $^{\circ}$ C for 48 h. The culture medium was plated on Palcam (CM0877) Agar and Oxford Agar media and incubated at 37 $^{\circ}$ C for 24 h. Suspected colonies were confirmed for catalase, gram, motility test, and Blood Agar Base to determine the presence of hemolysis.

Quantitative Estimation of mycoflora population (Yeasts and Molds)

The initial mycoflora in the food and wash water samples was determined by transferring 10 g and 10 ml of samples, respectively into 250 ml Erlenmeyer flasks containing 100 ml of 0.1% peptone water as diluents. Each flask was shaken at 140 RPM for 20 minutes on an orbital shaker (Gallenkamp, England). Serial dilutions up to 1:10⁻⁴ were made and 1 ml aliquot was plated by spread plate on 20 ml of Dichloran Rose Bengal Chloramphenicol Agar (Oxoid CM0727), with pH adjusted to 5.6, and containing Chloramphenicol supplement to inhibit the growth of bacteria. The plates were incubated at 25oC for 3-5 days per ISO 21527-1:2008.



16673



RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Results of the first category of samples of mixed vegetable salad (18/01, 18/02,18/03, 18/04, 18/05, 18/06, 18/07, 18/08,18/09, 18/10, 18/11, 18/12, 18/13, 18/14 and 18/15) investigated are presented in Table 1. The aerobic plate count of samples ranged from $< 1.0\pm0.02-4.73\pm0.8 \log_{10}$ CFU/g. *E-coli* counts also ranged $<1.0\pm0.02-2.53\pm0.3 \log_{10}$ CFU/g while *Bacillus cereus* counts were generally very low of 0- $<1.0\pm0.02 \log_{10}$ CFU/g. None of the samples tested contained *Listeria monocytogenes* and *Salmonella spp. Clostridium perfringens* and *Staphylococcus aureus* counts were also very low in range 0- $<1.0\pm0.02 \log_{10}$ CFU/g of sample. *Enterobacteriaceae* counts also ranged from $<1.0\pm0.02-1.90\pm0.04 \log_{10}$ CFU/g. Counts of molds and yeasts were generally low and ranged 0- 2.48±0.4 log 10 CFU/g and 0- $<1.0\pm0.02 \log_{10}$ CFU/g, respectively.

The second category of samples was the foods (18/16, 18/17,18/18, 18/19, 18/20, 18/21, 18/22 and 18/23), which recorded aerobic plate counts of range $<1.0\pm0.01$ - 2.48±0.4 log ¹⁰ CFU/g. *E-coli* counts also ranged 0- $<1.0\pm0.02 \log_{10}$ CFU/g. *Bacillus cereus* in most cases tested for, recorded very low counts of $<1.0 \log_{10}$ CFU/g. Again, none of the samples tested contained *Listeria monocytogenes* and *Salmonella spp. Clostridium perfringens* and *Staphylococcus aureus* counts were also very low of range 0- $<1.0\pm0.02 \log_{10}$ CFU/g of sample in most cases. Very low counts in the range 0- $<1.0\pm0.02 \log_{10}$ CFU/g were recorded for *Enterobacteriaceae*. Molds and yeast counts were generally low ($<1.0\pm0.02 \log_{10}$ CFU/g) (Table 2).

The third category of samples was the wash water samples (sample no.s 18/24, 18/25, 18/26, 18/27, 18/28, 18/29 and 18/30), which recorded aerobic plate counts, *E-coli* counts, and *Enterobactericea* all ranged 0- <1.0 \pm 0.04 log ₁₀ CFU/g. *Bacillus cereus*, *Clostridium perfringens, Staphylococcus aureus*, molds, and yeast counts were not examined. Again, none of the samples tested contained *Listeria monocytogenes* and *Salmonella spp*. (Table 3).

In humans, some strains of *E. coli* when ingested via food could result in gastroenteritis and diarrhea [17]. *Escherichia coli* present in food samples is a suggestion of fecal contamination and improper hygienic practices by food handlers [18], although they do not usually lead to foodborne illness in humans. Nonetheless, their presence in food can cause stomach upset and diarrhea in children especially in less developed countries [19]. Doyle and Erickson [20] postulated that due to its better association with potential contaminants by members of the *Enterobacteriaceae*, *E. coli* is more appropriate as an indicator of fecal contamination than heat-tolerant coliforms. Results of *E. coli* contamination in the present study were found to be in the same range of values reported by Abadias *et al.* [21] for samples of freshly chopped vegetables from Spain (11.4 %) and the United Kingdom, 13% of the vegetable salads were contaminated as reported by Sagoo *et al.* [22]. However, from Brazil, Prado *et al.* [23] reported a relatively higher percentage of 30 % contamination with *E. coli* were detected in samples of minimally processed vegetables. Abakari *et al.* [24] also recorded high values of range 0- 7.56 log₁₀ CFU/g representing 96.7 % of contaminated food samples in Tamale, Ghana.





In another related study, Oyinlonla *et al.* [25] also reported a range of $0.00\pm00-10.37\pm0.30 \log_{10}$ CFU/g in lettuce vegetables in Nigeria. Contrary to these findings, results obtained in this work satisfied the guidelines prescribed by the Ghana Standards Authority [26] (Table 4), which provides that in 25 g of sampled ready-to-eat vegetables, *E. coli* load of >10⁵ CFU/g is described as unsatisfactory for human consumption whereas a load of <10³ or 3 log 10 CFU/g is described as satisfactory (Table 4). This study recorded a low occurrence of *Bacillus cereus* in food samples investigated, which agreed with findings of Mensah *et al.* [7] as they sampled 511 different food samples and reported 5.5 % and 2.2 % contamination with *Bacillus cereus*. Similarly, Feglo and Sakyi [27] reported an occurrence of 2.2 % in salad samples from Kumasi, Ghana. In contrast, some other related studies showed much higher values than we found. Relatively high values of 26 % contamination (10⁸-10² CFU/g) of pasta salad samples in Leuven Belgium were reported by Dierick *et al.* [28] while Kortei *et al.* [29] reported approx. 20 % of contamination in stored gamma-irradiated steamed ready-to-eat mushrooms samples. Abakari *et al.* [24] also reported a range of 0-7.44 log 10 (93.3 %) in salad foods.

Ghana Standards Authority [26] and the Food and Drugs Authority [30] emphasized that Salmonella spp. should not be detected in 25g of ready- to- eat foods to be satisfactory for human consumption otherwise it should be described as unsatisfactory (Table 4). Following these guidelines, all samples examined did not indicate the presence of Salmonella spp. The presence of Salmonella spp. in food depicts a greater human health risk for consumers of such contaminated foods. The bacterium is mostly associated with cross-contamination of food products, especially from eggs and egg products [31]. The incidence of Salmonella spp. in food is generally associated with cross-contamination and also depended on irregular time-temperature chain [32]. Presumably, the nondetection of Salmonella spp. may be attributed to good hygiene practices by the restaurant staff as suggested by Bakobie et al. [18], since it was evident that most of the restaurant premises were kept tidy enough and could not have also resulted from crosscontamination of the food substances. The present study recorded no incidence of Salmonella spp. in all the food samples investigated, which was in agreement with findings of Al-Katib et al. [33] on the microbiological quality of food samples from a restaurant in Palestine. However, it contradicts the findings of Boateng [34] who detected the presence of Salmonella spp. in 32 % samples of pepper vegetables. Abakari et al. [24] also reported Salmonella spp. contamination in some food samples in Tamale, Ghana within the range of 0- $4.54 \log_{10} CFU/g$.

Overall occurrence of *L. monocytogenes* in the vegetables analyzed in this study was low, in line with previous results reported by Porto and Eiroa [35] who detected 3.2 % and 0.6 %, respectively of samples positive for *L. monocytogenes* among surveyed diverse vegetable samples (lettuce, parsley, watercress and spinach) from Brazilian markets. Fröder *et al.* [36] also reported the isolation of *L. innocua* (0.9 %) and *L. welshimeri* (0.6 %) from lettuce samples. Published data reported by Lin *et al.* [37] from the USA stressed that the prevalence of *L. monocytogenes* in salad samples was low (1.6 %). Conversely, Poniah *et al.* [38] reported the detection of 22.5 % of *L. monocytogenes* in minimally processed vegetables tested in a study in Malaysia. In Ghana, human listeriosis according to Osei- Somuah *et al.* [39] is not well documented although the occurrence of the illness among some animals has been reported. Also, low incidences of mean counts of range



12- 45 \log_{10} CFU/ml in salad coleslaw has been reported by Tano-Debrah *et al.* [40]. It must be highlighted that the low occurrence of *L. monocytogenes* in Ready-To-Eat foods be critically assessed, since this can sometimes be perceived as negative results (not present) due to low population of *Listeria spp.* However, in comparison with the greater micro-floral population where it is easier to detect the existence of listerial cells [41].

AFRICAN JOURNAL OF FOOD, AGRICULTURE

Volume 20 No. 6 SCIENCE

October 2020

The occurrence of molds and yeasts was minimal and so differed with findings of Annan-Prah *et al.* [42] who reported a range of 4 \log_{10} - 5 \log_{10} CFU/g from street vended foods in Cape Coast. Furthermore, Oranusi *et al.* [43] reported values of range 3.95- 6.97 log $_{10}$ CFU/g in foods sold in the student cafeteria in Nigeria. In a related study, Kortei *et al.* [15] also recorded values of range 3.5- 4 \log_{10} CFU/g on RTE steamed gamma-irradiated mushroom samples in Ghana.

Previous researchers [44, 45] have reported on the use of polluted river water or wastewater sewerage supplied by urban farmers to irrigate their vegetable crops which are used as salads. Thus, vegetables produced under such poor sanitation are highly prone to contamination [46]. Reported ranges of counts of previously done related works [24, 43, 47, 42] were high 10^4 - 10^8 . Richardson *et al.* [48] underscored that groundwater is generally acknowledged to be a better alternative to pond water because the water quality is protected from contamination. Notably, lettuce, cabbage, carrots, onions and tomatoes which constitute the main ingredients of raw vegetables grown in contaminated water irrigated farms, need to get special consideration since potential pathogenic microorganisms that get in contact and finally end up in the food chain and could pose potential health risks for consumers [49].

Contrary to the published findings of the afore mentioned researchers, our results were of lower counts and were acceptable per guidelines of Ghana Standards Authority [26] (Table 4) and International Commission for Microbiological Specifications for Foods (ICMSF) [49] guidelines, which state that ready-to-eat food with plate counts ranges of between $0 - 10^3$ (0- 3 log₁₀ CFU) is acceptable, between $10^4 - \le 10^5$ (4 - 5 log₁₀ CFU) is tolerable and 10^6 (6 log₁₀ CFU) and above is unacceptable. Presumably, some good manufacturing practices (GMP) were followed in the preparation of these foods and so contamination was well controlled as evidenced in the quality of water used to process the vegetables. Amissah and Owusu [50] reiterated that the level and magnitude of sanitary practices/ hygienic practices by food vendors can have a great impact on the microbial load in foods. Oyinlola et al. [26] also emphasized that high concentrations of enteric microorganisms (Enterobacteriaceae spp.) in the environment, as well as increase in the risk of producing cross-contamination, could arise as a result of the lack of sanitary and sewage management facilities in an area coupled with close interactions between people, livestock, water sources as well as fresh produce. Again, staff of restaurants normally undergo refresher courses in food safety periodically so such occurrences are expected.

CONCLUSION

In conclusion, the results from this study revealed that majority of the ready-to-eat mixed vegetable salad foods, ingredients and water samples analyzed, were of acceptable



ISSN 1684 5374



microbiological quality per the guidelines stipulated by the International Commission for the Microbiological Specifications of Food (ICMSF) and the Ghana Standards Authority.

This is an indication of the need for the implementation of good hygienic practices by food processors and consumers to minimize the risks of transmission of foodborne pathogens through ready-to-eat foods.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The authors are grateful to Messers Albert Abaka-Yawson, and George Osei-Yiadom of the Microbiology Laboratory, School of Allied Health Sciences, University of Health and Allied Sciences for undertaking the bacteriological and mycological analysis on the samples. We are also grateful to the staff and management of the restaurant.





Table 1: Results of the microbiological examination of some mixed vegetable salad foods and sauces (n=15)

Sample No.	Sample Code/Description	Aerobic Plate Count @ 30°C/72h CFU/g NMKL 86 2013	<i>E. coli</i> Count CFU/g NMKL 125 2005	B. cereus Count CFU/ g NMK L 67 2010	Listeria monocytogen es/25g ISO 11290-1 1996	<i>Cl.</i> <i>perfring</i> <i>ens</i> Count CFU/g ISO 7937 2004	Staph. aureus Count CFU/g NMKL 66 2009	Enterob acteriace ae Count CFU/g NMKL 144 2005	Salmonella spp./25g NMKL 71 1999	Mold & Yeast Count CFU/g ISO 21527-1: 2008	
										Yeasts	Molds
18/01	CHUNKY TOMATOES & POTATO & CUCUMBER SALAD, DILL SPRIG, LETTUCE LINER	3.0±0.5 log ₁₀	2.53±0.3 log ₁₀	N/E	NOT DETECTED	N/E	< 1±0.02 log ₁₀	1.90±0.0 5 log ₁₀	NOT DETECTED	N/E	N/E
18/02	SMOKED SALMON, FENNEL FINELY SHAVED, SHAVED CUCUMBER, CAPERBERRY, LEMON	N/E	1.60±0.04 log ₁₀	N/E	NOT DETECTED	N/E	< 1±0.01 log ₁₀	< 1±0.02 log10	NOT DETECTED	2.48±0 .3 log10	< 1±0.02 log ₁₀
18/03	ROASTED BBQ CHICKEN THIGHS DEBONED, SPICY BBQ SAUCE, JOLLOF RICE, SAUTEED PEAS WITH ONIONS.	3.65±0.5 log10	< 1±0.02 log10	< 1±0.02 log ₁₀	NOT DETECTED	< 1±0.02 log10	< 1±0.02 log10	< 1±0.01 log10	NOT DETECTED	N/E	N/E
18/04	BAKED SALMON, RED PEPPER COULIS, PAN FRIED ROSEMARY POLENTA, GRILLED COURGETTE, SAUTEED PEAS WITH ONIONS	3.60±0.5 log ₁₀	$< 1 \pm 0.02 \ log_{10}$	< 1±0.02 log ₁₀	NOT DETECTED	< 1±0.01 log10	< 1±0.02 log10	< 1±0.01 log10	NOT DETECTED	N/E	N/E





18/05	BEEF CHILLI CON CARNE WITH BLACK BEANS, WHITE STEAMED RICE, TOASTED SWEETCORN WITH GREEN PEAS AND DICED TOMATOES	< 1±0.02 log ₁₀	< 1±0.01 log ₁₀	< 1±0.02 log ₁₀	NOT DETECTED	< 1±0.01 log ₁₀	< 1±0.02 log ₁₀	< 1±0.01 log10	NOT DETECTED	N/E	N/E
18/06	TIRAMISU, CARAMELIZED PINEAPPLE MINI TRIANGLES, ORANGES HONEY SAUCE, MINT SPRIG GARNISH	< 1±0.02 log ₁₀	< 1±0.02 log10	N/E	NOT DETECTED	< 1±0.02 log ₁₀	< 1±0.02 log ₁₀	< 1±0.02 log10	NOT DETECTED	< 1±0.02 log ₁₀	< 1±0.02 log10
18/07	BAKED CHEESECAKE, FRUIT COULIS	4.58±0.6 log10	< 1 ±0.02 log10	N/E	NOT DETECTED	$< 1\pm 0.02 \ \log_{10}$	< 1±0.02 log10	< 1±0.02 log10	NOT DETECTED	< 1±0.02 log ₁₀	$< 1 \\ \pm 0.02 \\ \log_{10}$
18/08	SMOKED SALMON	4.73±0.8 log10	< 1±0.02 log10	< 1±0.02 log ₁₀	NOT DETETCED	< 1±0.02 log ₁₀	< 1±0.02 log10	< 1±0.01 log10	NOT DETECTED	N/E	N/E
18/09	ROASTED CHICKEN BREAST	< 1±0.02 log10	< 1±0.02 log10	< 1± log10	NOT DETECTED	< 1±0.02 log ₁₀	< 1±0.02 log10	< 1±0.02 log10	NOT DETECTED	N/E	N/E
18/10	APPLE LATTICE CAKE WITH VANILLA CUSTARD SAUCE	< 1±0.02 log10	< 1±0.02 log10	N/E	NOT DETECTED	$< 1\pm 0.02 \ \log_{10}$	< 1±0.01 log10	< 1±0.02 log10	NOT DETECTED	$< 1 \pm 0.02 \ \log_{10}$	< 1±0.01 log10
18/11	BREAD	< 1±0.02 log ₁₀	< 1±0.02 log10	< 1±0.02 log ₁₀	NOT DETECTED	< 1±0.02 log ₁₀	< 1±0.02 log ₁₀	< 1±0.02 log10	NOT DETECTED	< 1±0.02 log ₁₀	< 1±0.02 log10





18/12	SAUTEED SPINACH				NOT				NOT	< 1±	< 1±0.02
		2.61 ± 0.08	$< 1 \pm 0.02$	<	DETECTED	<	< 1±0.01	$< 1 \pm 0.02$	DETECTED	0.02	log ₁₀
		log ₁₀	log ₁₀	1±0.02		1 ± 0.02	log ₁₀	log ₁₀		log ₁₀	-
				log ₁₀		log ₁₀					
18/13	WHITE FISH				NOT				NOT		$< 1 \pm 0.02$
		$< 1 \pm 0.02$	$< 1 \pm 0.02$	<	DETECTED	<	$< 1 \pm 0.02$	$< 1 \pm 0.02$	DETECTED	<	log ₁₀
		log ₁₀	log ₁₀	1±0.02		1 ± 0.02	log ₁₀	log ₁₀		1 ± 0.02	
				log ₁₀		log ₁₀				log ₁₀	
18/14	MASHED POTATO				NOT				NOT	< 1	$< 1 \pm 0.02$
		$< 1 \pm 0.02$	<1±0.02	<	DETECTED	<	$< 1 \pm 0.02$	$< 1 \pm 0.02$	DETECTED	±0.02	log ₁₀
		log ₁₀	log ₁₀	1±0.02		1 ± 0.02	log ₁₀	log ₁₀		log ₁₀	
				log ₁₀		log_{10}					
18/15	BORDELAISE				NOT				NOT	<	< 1±
	SAUCE	$< 1 \pm 0.02$	< 1±0.02	<	DETECTED	<	$< 1 \pm 0.02$	$< 1 \pm 0.02$	DETECTED	1±0.02	0.02
		log ₁₀	log ₁₀	1±0.02		1 ± 0.02	log ₁₀	log ₁₀		log ₁₀	\log_{10}
				log ₁₀		log ₁₀					

N/E- Not Examined





Table 2: Results of the microbiological examination of some food ingredients samples (n=8)

Sample No.	Sample Code/Description	Aerobic Plate Count @ 30°C/72h CFU/g	<i>E. coli</i> Count CFU/g NMKL 125	<i>B.</i> <i>cereus</i> Count CFU/g NMKL	Listeria monocytogene s/25g ISO 11290-1	<i>Cl.</i> <i>perfringens</i> Count CFU/g	<i>Staph.</i> <i>aureus</i> Count CFU/g NMKL	Enterobact eriaceae Count CFU/g NMKL	Salmonella spp./25g NMKL 71	Mold & Yeast Count CFU/g ISO 21527-1: 2008
		NMKL 86 2013	2005	67 2010	1996	180 7937 2004	66 2009	144 2005	1999	Molds
18/16	BUTTER BLOCK	2.48±0.4 log10	< 1±0.01 log ₁₀	N/E	NOT DETECTED	N/E	< 1±0.02 log10	< 1±0.02 log10	NOT DETECTED	$< 1 \pm 0.02 \ log_{10}$
18/17	PASTRY FLOUR	< 1±0.02 log10	< 1 ±0.02 log10	N/E	NOT DETECTED	$< 1 \pm 0.02$ log ₁₀	< 1±0.02 log10	< 1±0.01 log ₁₀	NOT DETECTED	$< 1 \pm 0.02 \log_{10}$
18/18	ALMONDS POWDER	$< 1 \pm 0.02$ log ₁₀	$< 1 \pm 0.02$ log ₁₀	N/E	NOT DETECTED	N/E	N/E	<1±0.02 log10	NOT DETECTED	N/E
18/19	EGG LIQUID WHITE	< 1±0.02 log10	< 1±0.02 log ₁₀	N/E	NOT DETECTED	$< 1 \pm 0.01$ log ₁₀	$< 1 \pm 0.02$ log ₁₀	$< 1 \pm 0.01 \ \log_{10}$	NOT DETECTED	N/E
18/20	EGG LIQUID (MIXED)	2.15±0.8 log10	< 1±0.02 log10	N/E	NOT DETECTED	< 1±0.02 log10	< 1±0.02 log ₁₀	$< 1 \pm 0.02 \ \log_{10}$	NOT DETECTED	N/E
18/21	APPLE TOPFIL	2.58±0.8 log ₁₀	< 1±0.02 log ₁₀	$<1 \\ \pm 0.02 \\ \log_{10}$	NOT DETECTED	$< 1 \pm 0.02 \ \log_{10}$	$< 1 \pm 0.01 \ \log_{10}$	$< 1 \pm 0.01 \ log_{10}$	NOT DETECTED	N/E
18/22	MILK FULL CREAM	$< 1 \pm 0.02$ log ₁₀	$< 1 \pm 0.02$ log ₁₀	N/E	NOT DETECTED	N/E	<1±0.02 log10	$<1\pm0.01$ log ₁₀	NOT DETECTED	N/E
18/23	CUSTARD POWDER	N/E	<1±0.02 log ₁₀	N/E	NOT DETECTED	N/E	N/E	N/E	NOT DETECTED	N/E

N/E- Not Examined





Table 3: Results of the microbiological evaluation of water samples (n=7)

Sample No.	Sample Code/Description	Aerobic Plate Count @ 30°C/72h CFU/ml NMKL 86 2013	Enterobacte riaceae Count CFU/ml NMKL 144 2005	<i>E. coli</i> Count CFU/ml NMKL 125 2005	Staph. aureus Count CFU/ml NMKL 66 2009	<i>Cl.</i> <i>perfring</i> <i>ens</i> Count CFU/ml ISO 7937 2004	Salmonella spp./25ml NMKL 71 1999	Listeria monocytoge nes/25ml ISO 11290- 1 1996	B. cereus Count CFU/ml NMKL 67 2010	Mold & Yeast Count CFU/ml ISO 21527- 1: 2008 Molds
18/24	WATER FROM VEG PREPARATION TAP	$< 1 \pm 0.04 \ \log_{10}$	$< 1 \pm 0.02 \ \log_{10}$	<1±0.04 log10	N/E	N/E	NOT DETECTED	NOT DETECTED	N/E	N/E
18/25	ICE FROM LEFT ICE MACHINE	$< 1 \pm 0.04$ log ₁₀	< 1±0.04 log10	$< 1 \pm 0.04 \\ log_{10}$	N/E	N/E	NOT DETECTED	NOT DETECTED	N/E	N/E
18/26	WATER FROM PURCHASING (WASHING & DISINFECTION TAP)	< 1±0.04 log10	< 1±0.04 log ₁₀	< 1±0.04 log10	N/E	N/E	NOT DETECTED	NOT DETECTED	N/E	N/E
18/27	WATER FROM VEG. INFECTION AREA	$< 1 \pm 0.04$ log ₁₀	<1±0.04 log ₁₀	<1±0.04 log ₁₀	N/E	N/E	NOT DETECTED	NOT DETECTED	N/E	N/E
18/28	WATER FROM DISHWASHING AREA	<1±0.04 log10	<1±0.04 log10	< 1±0.04 log10	N/E	N/E	NOT DETECTED	NOT DETECTED	N/E	N/E
18/29	WATER FROM HAND WASHING STATION	< 1±0.04 log ₁₀	< 1±0.04 log ₁₀	< 1±0.04 log10	N/E	N/E	NOT DETECTED	NOT DETECTED	N/E	N/E
18/30	ICE FROM RIGHT ICE MAKING MACHINE	< 1±0.04 log ₁₀	< 1±0.04 log ₁₀	< 1±0.04 log10	N/E	N/E	NOT DETECTED	NOT DETECTED	N/E	N/E

N/E- Not Examined





Table 4: Guidance on the interpretation of results for specific foodborne pathogens in ready-to-eat food in general (colony-forming unit (CFU/g)

Criterion	Satisfactory	Borderline	Unsatisfactory (potentially injurious to health and/or unfit for human consumption)
<i>Escherichia coli</i> 0157 (and other <i>Shiga</i> toxin- producing <i>E. coli</i> (STEC)	n.d. in 25g	N/A	Detected in 25g
Salmonella spp.	n.d. in 25g	N/A	Detected in 25g
Shigella spp.	n.d. in 25g	N/A	Detected in 25g
Bacillus cereus	$<10^{2} \text{ or}$ 2 log ₁₀	10^2 to $<10^4$ 2 to 4 log ₁₀	$>10^4$ 4 log 10
Hygiene indicator organism	satisfactory	borderline	Unsatisfactory (potentially injurious to health and/or unfit for human consumption)
Escherichia coli	<20	20 to $< 10^2$	>10 ²
	1.3 log 10	$1.3 \text{ to } 2 \log_{10}$	2 log 10

Ghana Standards Authority Guidelines for assessing the Microbiological Safety of Ready-to-Eat foods

nd - Not determined

N/A- not applicable



REFERENCES

- 1. Ankita R Bacterial load on street Vended Salads in Jaipur City, India, *Internet Journal of Food Safety* 2010; **12**: 136–139.
- 2. **Amoah D** Microbial risk assessment of mixed vegetable salads from selected canteens in the Kumasi metropolis, Ghana. 2014; 41-56.
- 3. **Ramteke A, Khanuja SK, Chandrakar OP and T Gupta** Survival benefits dominate the whole life risk coverage among the rural population of Raipur postal division of Chattisgarth state. *Int J Res Sci Manage*. 2016; **3(5)**: 23–6.
- 4. **Coulibaly-Kalpy J, Agbo EA and TA Dadie** Microbiological quality of raw vegetables and ready to eat products sold in Abidjan (Côte d'Ivoire) markets. *Afr J Microbiol Res.*, 2017; **11(10)**: 204–210.
- 5. Rautiainen S, Levitan EB, Mittleman MA and A Wolk Fruit and vegetable intake and rate of heart failure: a population-based prospective cohort for women. *Eur J. Heart Fail.* 2015; 17(1): 20-26 DOI: 10.1002/ejhf.191
- 6. **Tambekar DH and RH Mundhada** Bacteriological quality of salad vegetables sold in Amravati City (India), *Journal of Biological Sciences* 2006; **6(1)**: 28–30.
- Mensah P, Yeboah-Manu D, Owusu-Darko K and A Ablordey Street foods in Accra, Ghana: how safe are they? *Bulletin of the* World Health Organization, 2002; 80 (7): 546–554.
- 8. Udo S, Andy I, Umo A and M Ekpo Potential human pathogens (Bacteria) and their Antibiogram in Ready to eat salads sold in Calabar, South-South, Nigeria, *The Internet Journal of Tropical Medicine*, 2009; **5** (2): 1-2.
- 9. Ababio FW and P Lovatt A review of food safety and food hygiene studies in Ghana. Food Control, 2014; 47: 92-97. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodcont.2014.06.041
- 10. **World Health Organization.** Foodborne diseases; A focus for health education, 53rd world health assembly, Geneva. 2000.
- 11. **Annor GA and EA Baiden** Evaluation of food hygiene knowledge attitudes and practices of food handlers in food businesses in Accra, Ghana. *Food and Nutrition Sciences*, .2011; **2**: 830.
- 12. World Health Organization. WHO's first ever global estimates of foodborne diseases find children under 5 account for almost one third of deaths. World Health Organization, Geneva, Switzerland. 2015. <u>https://www.who.int/news-room/detail/03-12-2015-who-s-first-ever-global-estimates-of-foodborne-diseases-find-children-under-5-account-for-almost-one-third-of-deaths</u> *Accessed- 12th February, 2020.*





- 13. Sabithi A, Kumar RN, Kashinath L, Bhaskar V and VS Rao Microbial quality of salads served along with street foods of Hyderabad, India. *International Journal of Microbiology*, 2014; Volume 2014, Article ID 932191, 6 pages, <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1155/2014/932191</u>
- 14. **Foskett P, Ceserani V and R Kinton** The theory of catering 10th ed. (Hodder and Stoughton: London, 531). 2003.
- 15. Kortei NK, Odamtten GT, Obodai M and M Wiafe-Kwagyan Mycofloral profile and the radiation sensitivity (D10 values) of solar-dried and gammairradiated *Pleurotus ostreatus* (Jacq. Ex. Fr.) Kummer fruitbodies stored in two different packaging materials. *Food Science and Nutrition*, 2017; 1-9. DOI: 10.1002/fsn3.545
- IARC International Agency for Research on Cancer. Some traditional herbal medicines, some mycotoxins, naphthalene and styrene. IARC monographs on the evaluation of carcinogenic risks to humans. 2002; 82: 1–556. Available from <u>http://monographs.iarc.fr/ENG/Monographs/vol82/mono82.pdf</u> Accessed- 12th February, 2020.
- 17. Akter N Study on Bacteriological Quality of Street-vended Foods Collected from Different Private Universities in Dhaka City, Bangladesh. A Dissertation Submitted to East-West University, Dhaka, Bangladesh in Partial Fulfillment of Requirements for the Degree of Bachelor of Pharmacy. Department of Pharmacy, East-West University. 2016.
- 18. Bakobie N, Addae AS, Duwiejuah AB, Cobbina SJ and S Miniyila Microbial profile of common spices and spice blends used in Tamale, Ghana. *Int J. Food Contam*, 2017; 4(10): 1–5.
- Adams MR and MO Moss Food Microbiology (3rd edition), Royal Society of Chemistry. Cambridge, United Kingdom RSC Publishing xiv 2008; 463pp.
- 20. Doyle MP and MC Erickson Closing the door on the fecal coliform assay. Microbe, 2006; 1(4): 162-163.
- 21. Abadias M, Usall J, Anguera M, Solsona C and I Viñas Microbiological quality of fresh, minimally-processed fruit and vegetables, and sprouts from retail establishments. *International Journal of Food Microbiology*, 2008; **123(1-2)**: 121-129.
- 22. Sagoo SK, Little CL, Ward L, Gillespie IA and RT Mitchell Microbiological study of ready-to-eat salad vegetables from retail establishments uncovers a national outbreak of salmonellosis. *Journal of Food Protection*, 2003; 66(3): 403-409.





- 23. Prado SPT, Ribeiro EGA, Capuano DM, Aquino AL, Rocha GM and AMM Bergamini Microbiological and parasitic quality and labeling adequacy of minimally processed vegetables commercialized in Ribeirão Preto, SP/Brazil. *Revista do Instituto Adolfo Lutz*, 2008; 67(3): 221-227.
- 24. **Abakari G, Cobinna SJ and E Yeleliere** Microbial quality of ready-to-eat vegetable salads vended in the central business district of Tamale, Ghana. *International Journal of Food Contamination* 2018; **5(3)**: 1-9. <u>https://doi.org/10.1186/s40550-018-0065-2</u>
- 25. Oyinlola LA, Obadina AO, Omemu AM and OB Oyewole Prevention of microbial hazard on fresh-cut lettuce through the adoption of food safety and hygienic practices by lettuce farmers. *Food Science & Nutrition* 2017; **5(1)**: 67–7 DOI: 10.1002/fsn3.365
- 26. Ghana Standards Authority. (GS:955) Guidelines for Assessing the Microbiological Safety of Ready-to-Eat Foods in Ghana. 2019.
- 27. Feglo P and K Sakyi Bacterial contamination of street vending food in Kumasi, Ghana. *Journal of Medical and Biochemical Sciences*, 2012; 1(1): 1–8.
- Dierick K, Coillie EV, Swiecicka I, Meyfroidt G, Devlieger H, Meulemans A, Hoedemaekers G, Fourie L, Heyndrikx M and J Mahillon Fatal outbreak of Bacillus cereus-associated food poisoning. *Journal of Clinical Microbiology* 2005; 43(8): 4277-4279. DOI: 10.1128/JCM.43.8.4277-4279.2005
- 29. Kortei NK, Odamtten GT, Appiah V, Obodai M, Annan TA, Adu- Gyamfi A, Akonor PT, Annan SNY, Acquah SK, Armah JO and SWO Mills Microbiological quality assessment of gamma-irradiated fresh and dried mushrooms (*Pleurotus ostreatus*) and determination of D₁₀ values of *Bacillus cereus* in storage packs. *European Journal of Biotechnology and Biosciences*, 2014; **2** (1): 28-34.
- 30. **FDA**. Food and Drug Administration, Center for Food Safety and Applied Nutrition, 2008. Guidance for Industry: Guide to minimize food safety hazards for fresh-cut fruits and vegetables. Fed. Reg. 2008; **72**: 11364–11368.
- 31. National Institute of Allergy and Infectious Disease NIAID. Foodborne disease Bethesdo, MD20892–2520. Nigeria. *Food Control.* 2002; **10**: 9–14.
- 32. Mashak Z, Langroodi AM., Ehsani A, Fathabad AE and A IIkhanipoor Microbiological quality of ready-to-eat foods of Tehran province. *African Journal* of Food Science 2015; 9(5): 257-261.





- 33. Al-Khatib IA, Giacaman R, Husseini A, Ramlawi A, Atiyya I and I Salem Microbiological quality of food samples from restaurants and sweet shops in developing countries: a case study from the occupied Palestine territory. *International Journal of Environmental Health Research* 2004; 14(6): 443-452. DOI: 10.1080/09603120400012835
- 34. **Boateng AE** Assessment of food hygiene practices by street food vendors and microbial quality of selected foods sold. A study at Dunkwa-On-Offin, Upper Denkyira East Municipality of the Central Region. *MSc thesis* Department of Community Health, College of Public Health. KNUST. 2014.
- 35. **Porto E and MNU Eiroa** Occurrence of *Listeria monocytogenes* in vegetables. *Dairy, Food Environmental, and Sanitation*, 2001; **21(4)**: 282-286.
- 36. Fröder H, Martins CG, Souza KLO, Landgraf M, Franco BDGM and MT Destro Minimally processed vegetable salads: a microbial quality evaluation. *Journal of Food Protection*, 2007;**70(5)**: 1277-1280.
- 37. Lin CM, Fernando SY and CI Wei Occurrence of *Listeria monocytogenes*, *Salmonella spp., Escherichia coli*, and *E. coli* O157: H7 in vegetable salads. *Food Control*, 1996;7(3): 135-140.
- 38. **Ponniah J, Robin T, Pale MS, Radu S, Ghazali FM and CY Kqueen** *Listeria monocytogenes* in raw salad vegetables sold at the retail level in Malaysia. Food *Control*, 2010; **21(5)**: 774-778.
- Osei-Somuah A, Aning KG, Nartey PKW and JK Abbam Listeria abortions in sheep on the Accra plains: A case report. *Ghana Jnl Agric. Sci.* 2000; 33(1): 87-91. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.4314/gjas.v33i1.1888</u>
- 40. **Tano-Debrah K, Saalia FK, Bediako Amoa B, Appiah J, Dogbe E and K Bomfeh** *Listeria monocytogenes*: An emerging foodborne pathogen in Ghana?. Presentation at the University of Ghana's College of Health Sciences Annual Scientific Conference on the increasing burden of non-communicable diseases in Ghana. 2011.
- 41. **de Oliveira MA, de Souza VM, Bergamini AMM and ECP De Martinis** Microbiological quality of ready-to-eat minimally processed vegetables consumed in Brazil. *Food Control*, 2011; **22**: 1400-1403. DOI:10.1016/j.foodcont.2011.02.020
- 42. Annan-Prah A, Amewowor DHAK, Osei-Kofi J, Amoono SE, Akorli SY, Saka E and HA Ndadi Street foods: Handling, hygiene and client expectations in a World Heritage Site Town, Cape Coast, Ghana. *African Journal of Microbiology Research*, 2011; **5(13)**: 1629–1634.





- 43. Oranusi SU, Oguoma OI and E Agusi Microbiological quality assessment of foods sold in student's cafeterias. *Global Research Journal of Microbiology*, 2013; 3(1): 1-7.
- 44. **Kayombo MC and AW Mayo** Assessment of microbial quality of vegetables irrigated with polluted waters in Dar es Salaam city, Tanzania. *Environment and Ecology Research*, 2018; **6(4)**: 229-239. DOI: 10.13189/eer.2018.060403
- 45. Ullah H, Khan I and I Ullah Impact of sewage-contaminated water on the soil, vegetables, and underground water of peri-urban Pashawar, Pakistan. *Environ. Moni. Assess.* 2012; **184(10)**: 6411-21.
- 46. Woldetsadik D, Drechsel P, Keraita B, Itanna F, Erko B and H Gebriekidan Microbiological quality of lettuce (*Lactuca sativa*) irrigated with wastewater in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia and the effect of green salads washing methods. *International Journal of Food Contamination*, 2017; **4(3)**: 1-9. DOI 10.1186/s40550-017-0048-8.
- 47. Blaak H, Lynch G, Italiaander R, Hamidjaja RA, Schets FM and AM de Roda Husman Multidrug-resistant and extended-spectrum beta-lactamase-producing *Escherichia coli* in Dutch surface water and wastewater. *PLoS One*, 2015; 10(6): e0127752.
- 48. **Richardson HY, Nichols G, Lane C, Lake IR and PR Hunter** Microbiological surveillance of private water supplies in England: the impact of environmental and climate factors on water quality. *Water Res.* 2009; **43**: 2159–2168.
- 49. International Commission on Microbiological Specifications for Foods (ICMSF). Microorganisms in Foods 5: Microbiological Specifications of Pathogens. 1996.
- 50. Amissah A and J Owusu Assessing the microbiological quality of food sold on and around Koforidua Polytechnic in Ghana. *Annals of Food Science and Technology*, 2012; 13(1): 60–67. Targoviste: Valahia University Press.

